

# 별첨 2

## 배제문헌

### 1. 기존 체계적 문헌고찰에 포함된 일차문헌 중 배제된 15편

#### 문헌배제사유

1. 무릎 골관절염을 동반한 반월판 연골 손상 환자를 대상으로 하지 않은 연구
2. 관절경 반월판 연골 절제술이 시행되지 않은 연구
3. 목표한 비교군(가짜 수술, 보존적 치료, 무처치 대조군)을 포함시키지 않은 연구
4. 관심있는 결과지표를 보고하지 않은 연구
5. 사람을 대상으로 한 연구가 아닌 경우(전임상, 동물연구 등)
6. 원저가 아닌 경우(초록, 학회발표 등)
7. 회색문헌(학위논문, 기관보고서 등 peer-review를 거치지 않은 연구)
8. 동일한 대상자, 동일 결과를 중복 출판한 경우

- 기존 SR(Systematic Review): #1-Abram(2020), #26-Lamplot(2016), #29-Lee(2020), #34-Ma(2020), #92-Li(2020)

#	구분 (Source)	1저자(연도) /연구설계	서지정보	배제사유	비고
1	기존 SR (1, 92)	Kise (2016)	N. J. Kise, M. A. Risberg, S. Stensrud, J. Ranstam, L. Engebretsen, and E. M. Roos, "Exercise therapy versus arthroscopic partial meniscectomy for degenerative meniscal tear in middle aged patients: randomised controlled trial with two year follow-up," British Journal of Sports Medicine, vol. 50, no. 23, pp. 1473-1480, 2016.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	KL 0-3/ 총 140명중 100명이 grade 0
2	기존 SR (26)	Merchan (1993)	Merchan EC, Galindo E. Arthroscope-guided surgery versus nonoperative treatment for limited degenerative osteoarthritis of the femorotibial joint in patients over 50 years of age: a prospective comparative study. Arthroscopy 1993;9:663-667	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	대상자가 대퇴관절염

#	구분 (Source)	1저자(연도) /연구설계	서지정보	배제사유	비고
3	기존 SR (34)	Stensrud (2015) /RCT	Stensrud S, Risberg MA, Roos EM. Effect of exercise therapy compared with arthroscopic surgery on knee muscle strength and functional performance in middle-aged patients with degenerative meniscus tears: a 3-mo followup of a randomized controlled trial. American journal of physical medicine & rehabilitation. 2015;94:460-73.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	KL 0-1 ( no or mild OA) KL 0(70%)~ KL 1(20%)이 90% 정도임
4	기존 SR (1, 26, 29, 34)	Gauffin (2014) /RCT	Gauffin H, Tagesson S, Meunier A, et al. Knee arthroscopic surgery is beneficial to middle-aged patients with meniscal symptoms: a prospective, randomised, single-blinded study. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2014;22:1808-16.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	/NCT01288768 3,12개월 시점에서 150명 대상으로 KOOS pain 등 확인 *KL 0-2 (KL 0: 69명) KL 1 (45%) KL 2( 5%)
5	기존 SR (1)	Gauffin (2017) /RCT	Gauffin H, Sonesson S, Meunier A, et al. Knee arthroscopic surgery in middle-aged patients with meniscal symptoms: A 3-year follow-up of a prospective, randomized study. Am J Sports Med 2017;45:2077-84.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	/NCT01288768 3년 시점에서 150명 대상으로 KOOS pain 등 확인
6	기존 SR (26, 29, 34)	Sihvonen (2013) /RCT	Sihvonen R, Paavola M, Malmivaara A, et al. Arthroscopic partial meniscectomy versus sham surgery for a degenerative meniscal tear. N Engl J Med 2013;369:2515-2524	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	KL 0-1만 포함 KL 0이 43%, KL1이 57%
7	기존 SR (1)	Sihvonen (2016) /RCT	Sihvonen R, Englund M, Turkiewicz A, et al. Mechanical symptoms and arthroscopic partial meniscectomy in patients with degenerative meniscus tear. Ann Intern Med 2016;164:449.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	KL 0-1만 포함 KL 0이 43%, KL1이 57%
8	기존 SR (34)	Sihvonen (2018) /RCT	Sihvonen R, Paavola M, Malmivaara A, et al. Arthroscopic partial meniscectomy versus placebo surgery for a degenerative meniscus tear: a 2-year follow-up of the randomised controlled trial. Annals of the rheumatic diseases. 2018;77:188-95.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	KL 0-1만 포함 KL 0이 43%, KL1이 57%

#	구분 (Source)	1저자(연도) /연구설계	서지정보	배제사유	비고
9	기존 SR (1)	Roos (2018) /RCT	Roos EM, Hare KB, Nielsen SM, et al. Better outcome from arthroscopic partial meniscectomy than skin incisions only? A sham-controlled randomised trial in patients aged 35–55 years with knee pain and an MRI-verified meniscal tear. <i>BMJ Open</i> 2018;8:e019461.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	KL 0: 43% KL 1: 39% KL 2: 18%
10	기존 SR (1, 29, 34)	Herrlin (2007) /RCT	Herrlin S, Hallander M, Wange P, Weidenhielm L, Werner S. Arthroscopic or conservative treatment of degenerative medial meniscal tears: a prospective randomised trial. <i>Knee surgery, sports traumatology, arthroscopy : official journal of the ESSKA.</i> 2007;15:393-401.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	Ahlbacks 0 or 1 /90명 대상
11	기존 SR (1, 29, 34, 92)	Herrlin (2013) /RCT	Herrlin SV, Wange PO, Lapidus G, et al. Is arthroscopic surgery beneficial in treating non-traumatic, degenerative medial meniscal tears? A five year follow-up. <i>Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc</i> 2013;21:358-64.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	Ahlbacks 0 or 1 /90명 대상
12	기존 SR (1, 29)	Østerås (2012)	Østerås H, Østerås B, Torstensen TA. Medical exercise therapy, and not arthroscopic surgery, resulted in decreased depression and anxiety in patients with degenerative meniscus injury. <i>J Bodyw Mov Ther</i> 2012;16:456-63.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	KL 3-4 제외되었고 비율을 알수없음
13	기존 SR (1, 29, 34, 92)	Yim (2013)	Yim JH, Seon JK, Song EK, et al. A comparative study of meniscectomy and nonoperative treatment for degenerative horizontal tears of the medial meniscus. <i>Am J Sports Med.</i> 2013;41:1565-1570.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님	골관절염환자 제외(KL-2이상 제외) KL 0-1 비율은 알수 없음
14	기존 SR (26)	Aaron (2006) /Cohort	Aaron RK, Skolnick AH, Reinert SE, Ciombor DM. Arthroscopic debridement for osteoarthritis of the knee. <i>J Bone Joint Surg [Am]</i> 2006;88-A:936-943.	2: 사전 정의한 중재법이 아님	Arthroscopic debridement로 다양한 술기를 포함함
15	기존 SR (1)	Vermesan (2013) /RCT	Vermesan D, Prejbeanu R, Laitin S, et al. Arthroscopic debridement compared to intra-articular steroids in treating degenerative medial meniscal tears. <i>Eur Rev Med Pharmacol Sci</i> 2013;17:3192-6.	2: 사전 정의한 중재법이 아님	Arthroscopic debridement로 다양한 술기를 포함함

## 2. 추가 검색된 일차문헌 중 배제된 24편

### 문헌배제사유

1. 사전에 정의한 연구대상자에 대한 연구가 아닌 문헌
2. 사전에 정의한 중재법에 대해 연구가 아닌 문헌
3. 사전에 정의한 비교군이 아닌 문헌
4. 사전에 정의한 결과지표를 보고하지 않은 문헌
5. 핵심질문이 동일한 최신 SR이 있는 경우

#	1저자(연도)	서지정보	배제사유
1	Abram (2019)	Abram SGF, Judge A, Beard DJ, Carr AJ, Price AJ. Long-term rates of knee arthroplasty in a cohort of 834 393 patients with a history of arthroscopic partial meniscectomy. <i>Bone &amp; Joint Journal</i> . 2019;101-B(9):1071-80.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
2	Gauffin (2017)	Gauffin H, Sonesson S, Meunier A, Magnusson H, Kvist J. Knee Arthroscopic Surgery in Middle-Aged Patients With Meniscal Symptoms: A 3-Year Follow-up of a Prospective, Randomized Study. <i>American Journal of Sports Medicine</i> . 2017;45(9):2077-84.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
3	Herrlin (2007)	Herrlin S, Hallander M, Wange P, Weidenhielm L, Werner S. Arthroscopic or conservative treatment of degenerative medial meniscal tears: a prospective randomised trial. <i>Knee Surgery, Sports Traumatology, Arthroscopy</i> . 2007;15(4):393-401.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
4	Herrlin (2013)	Herrlin SV, Wange PO, Lapidus G, Hallander M, Werner S, Weidenhielm L. Is arthroscopic surgery beneficial in treating non-traumatic, degenerative medial meniscal tears? A five year follow-up. <i>Knee Surgery, Sports Traumatology, Arthroscopy</i> . 2013;21(2):358-64.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
5	Ji (2015)	Ji C, Lin X, Zhu L, Li M. McMurray Test: A Prediction of Arthroscopic Meniscectomy Outcomes in Patients with Knee Osteoarthritis. <i>Cell Biochemistry &amp; Biophysics</i> . 2015;72(1):269-73.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
6	Mills (2008)	Mills PM, Wang Y, Cicuttini FM, et al. Tibio-femoral cartilage defects 3-5 years following arthroscopic partial medial meniscectomy. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2008;16(12):1526-1531.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
7	Roos (2008)	Roos EM, Bremander AB, Englund M, Lohmander LS. Change in self-reported outcomes and objective physical function over 7 years in middle-aged subjects with or at high risk of knee osteoarthritis. <i>Annals of the Rheumatic Diseases</i> . 2008;67(4):505-10.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
8	Thorlund (2010)	Thorlund JB, Aagaard P, Roos EM. Thigh muscle strength, functional capacity, and self-reported function in patients at high risk of knee osteoarthritis compared with controls. <i>Arthritis care &amp; research</i> . 2010;62(9):1244-51.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
9	Thorlund (2012)	Thorlund JB, Aagaard P, Roos EM. Muscle strength and functional performance in patients at high risk of knee osteoarthritis: a follow-up study. <i>Knee Surgery, Sports Traumatology, Arthroscopy</i> . 2012;20(6):1110-7.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님

#	1저자(연도)	서지정보	배제사유
10	Yim (2013)	Yim JH, Seon JK, Song EK, Choi JI, Kim MC, Lee KB, et al. A comparative study of meniscectomy and nonoperative treatment for degenerative horizontal tears of the medial meniscus. <i>American Journal of Sports Medicine</i> . 2013;41(7):1565-70.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
11	Kise (2019)	Kise NJ, Roos EM, Stensrud S, Engebretsen L, Risberg MA. The 6-m timed hop test is a prognostic factor for outcomes in patients with meniscal tears treated with exercise therapy or arthroscopic partial meniscectomy: a secondary, exploratory analysis of the Odense-Oslo meniscectomy versus exercise (OMEX) trial. <i>Knee Surgery, Sports Traumatology, Arthroscopy</i> . 2019;27(8):2478-87.	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
12	Sonesson (2020)	Sonesson S, Kvist J, Yakob J, Hedeveik H, Gauffin H. Knee Arthroscopic Surgery in Middle-Aged Patients With Meniscal Symptoms: A 5-Year Follow-up of a Prospective, Randomized Study. <i>Orthopaedic Journal of Sports Medicine</i> . 2020;8(1).	1:사전에 정의한 대상자가 아님
13	Valdes (2014)	Valdes AM, Suokas AK, Doherty SA, Jenkins W, Doherty M. History of knee surgery is associated with higher prevalence of neuropathic pain-like symptoms in patients with severe osteoarthritis of the knee. <i>Seminars in Arthritis &amp; Rheumatism</i> . 2014;43(5):588-92.	2:사전 정의한 중재법이 아님
14	Katz (2016)	Katz JN, Wright J, Spindler KP, Mandl LA, Safran-Norton CE, Reinke EK, et al. Predictors and Outcomes of Crossover to Surgery from Physical Therapy for Meniscal Tear and Osteoarthritis: a Randomized Trial Comparing Physical Therapy and Surgery. <i>Journal of bone and joint surgery American volume</i> . 2016;98(22):1890-6.	3:사전에 정의한 비교군이 아님
15	Neumann (2020)	Neumann J, Kern K, Sun D, Foreman SC, Joseph GB, Gersing AS, et al. Cartilage degeneration post-meniscectomy performed for degenerative disease versus trauma: data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. <i>Skeletal Radiology</i> . 2020;49(2):231-40.	3:사전에 정의한 비교군이 아님
16	Collins (2020)	Collins JE, Losina E, Marx RG, Guermazi A, Jarraya M, Jones MH, et al. Early Magnetic Resonance Imaging-Based Changes in Patients With Meniscal Tear and Osteoarthritis: Eighteen-Month Data From a Randomized Controlled Trial of Arthroscopic Partial Meniscectomy Versus Physical Therapy. <i>Arthritis care &amp; research</i> . 2020;72(5):630-40.	4: 사전 정의한 결과지표를 보고하지 않음
17	Englund (2009)	Englund M, Guermazi A, Roemer FW, Aliabadi P, Yang M, Lewis CE, et al. Meniscal tear in knees without surgery and the development of radiographic osteoarthritis among middle-aged and elderly persons: The Multicenter Osteoarthritis Study. <i>Arthritis &amp; Rheumatism</i> . 2009;60(3):831-9.	4: 사전 정의한 결과지표를 보고하지 않음
18	Rothy (2013)	Rothy A, Cherney S, Fening SD, Duryea J, Winalski CS, Jones MH, et al. Joint space loss after arthroscopic partial meniscectomy: Data from the osteoarthritis initiative. <i>Orthopaedic Journal of Sports Medicine</i> . 2013;1(4 Supplement 1).	4: 사전 정의한 결과지표를 보고하지 않음
19	Sohn (1998)	Sohn JM, Kim HG, Cho WS. Arthroscopic Debridement in Osteoarthritis of the Knee. <i>Knee Surgery and Related Research</i> . 1998;10(1):104-8.	4: 사전 정의한 결과지표를 보고하지 않음

#	1저자(연도)	서지정보	배제사유
20	Mittal (2016)	Mittal R. Selected summaries: exercise or surgery for meniscal tears: do we have an answer? National medical journal of India. 2016;29(6):338-9.	5: 사전에 정의한 연구디자인이 아님
21	Katz (2013)	Katz JN, Brophy RH, Chaisson CE, de Chaves L, Cole BJ, Dahm DL, et al. Surgery versus physical therapy for a meniscal tear and osteoarthritis. New England journal of medicine. 2013;368(18):1675-84.	7: 기존 체계적 문헌고찰에 포함된 문헌
22	Kise (2016)	Kise NJ, Risberg MA, Stensrud S, Ranstam J, Engebretsen L, Roos EM. Exercise therapy versus arthroscopic partial meniscectomy for degenerative meniscal tear in middle aged patients: randomised controlled trial with two year follow-up. BMJ (Online). 2016;354(no pagination).	7: 기존 체계적 문헌고찰에 포함된 문헌
23	Roos (2018)	Roos EM, Hare KB, Nielsen SM, Christensen R, Lohmander LS. Better outcome from arthroscopic partial meniscectomy than skin incisions only? A sham-controlled randomised trial in patients aged 35-55 years with knee pain and an MRI-verified meniscal tear. BMJ Open. 2018;8(2):e019461.	7: 기존 체계적 문헌고찰에 포함된 문헌
24	van de Graaf (2018)	van de Graaf VA, Noorduy JCA, Willigenburg NW, Butter IK, de Gast A, Mol BW, et al. Effect of Early Surgery vs Physical Therapy on Knee Function Among Patients With Nonobstructive Meniscal Tears: The ESCAPE Randomized Clinical Trial. JAMA. 2018;320(13):1328-37.	7: 기존 체계적 문헌고찰에 포함된 문헌